# **History 4P43 Censorship: A Comparative Approach**

Fall 2012 Professor McLeod

Seminar: Monday 11-2 PL 408

Office: GLN 241 E-mail: jmcleod@brocku.ca



Freedom of the Press 1797, Bibliothèque nationale de France (via ARTstor)

# **Course Objectives**

Students in this course will use some of the methods in the field known as the History of the Book to examine attitudes toward censorship from the Middle Ages to the present. We will also study the methods used by governments and other authorities to promote and maintain ideological control and assess their effectiveness. Special focus will be placed on analysing the arguments for and against censorship in a number of different historical contexts and on the early development of freedom of the press as an ideal.

## Required Texts:

eds. John Mccormick and Mairi MacInnes, *Versions of Censorship*. Ray Bradbury, *Fahrenheit 451*.

### **Course Requirements**

- 1. Preparation for and active participation in weekly **seminars** is the essential part of this course. All students will read and be prepared to discuss some of the assigned readings every week. Students are expected to read several articles and book chapters (at least 80 pages) for each weekly seminar. In addition students will **lead** one seminar in the course.
- 2. Each student will write one short **document study** 5 pages in length assessing the arguments on censorship in Milton's *Areopagitica* in *Versions of Censorship*, eds McCormick and MacInnes, pp. 8-34. In your paper you must present both the arguments in favour censorship that Milton tries to refute and his own argument about censorship. Due in class on October 22, 2012.
- 3. Each student will write one **research essay** on a topic to be assigned by the instructor. The essay should be about 4,000 words in length and must have proper footnotes or endnotes and a critical bibliography (a list of the books and articles used in preparing the essay with a few sentences giving your opinion of the value of each strengths, weaknesses, bias etc.). The critical bibliography and statement of your central argument must be submitted **before November 26, 2012. The essay is due on December 3, 2012** and marks will be deducted from late essays at the rate of 5 % a day and weekend. No essays will be accepted after December 10, 2012.

Before writing their essays students should consult Mary Lynne Rampolla, *A Pocket Guide to Writing in History* which is available in the bookstore. Also, consult Derek Jones ed. *Censorship: A World Encyclopedia*.

4. Each student will **present a preliminary report** on his or her research to the seminar on an assigned date.

*Plagiarism* is the use of another's ideas without acknowledgment. For anything other than a single short phrase, words taken from another must be set off in quotation marks and the source cited. The course penalty for plagiarism is zero on

the assignment. Consult your university calendar for the further consequences of committing plagiarism at Brock.

Grade:	Seminar Participation	40%
	Seminar Leadership	10%
	Research Report	10%
	Document Study	10%
	Research Essay	30%

- 1. September 10, 2012 Introductory Seminar. Before this seminar purchase, study and identify subjects that interest you in John McCormick and Mairi MacInnes eds., *Versions of Censorship*.
- **2. September 17, 2012 The Debate on the Impact of Printing and Darnton's Communication Model.** In 1979 Elizabeth Eisenstein published a very influential book on the impact of printing. What were her arguments? Why was this book so influential? Reflect on the importance of her argument. Is revolution an appropriate word? Why do some historians disagree with her? What did they say? What alternate view of the impact of printing do they offer? Which view do you find more accurate? Think about how information moved through eighteenth-century society and the role of print. Assess Robert Darnton's model for understanding this. How have his views changed between 1982 when he first offered this model and 2007 when he revisited it.

#### All Students will read

"How Revolutionary was the Print Revolution?" Forum in the *American Historical Review*, Vol. 107, Issue 1, February, 2002, pp. 84-128. Articles by Grafton, Eisenstein, Johns. (On-line)

Adrian Johns, Review of David McKitterick "Print, Manuscript and the Search for Order" in *History of Intellectual Culture*, 2006 vol. 6, no.1. http://www.ucalgary.ca/hic/issues/vol6/8 (On-line)

Robert Darnton, "An Early Information Society: News and the Media in Eighteenth-Century Paris" *American Historical Review*, vol. 105, no. 1, Feb. 2000, pp. 1-35. (On-line)

Robert Darnton, "What is the history of books?" in *The Kiss of Lamourette* :*Reflections in Cultural History* (Norton, 1990), pp.107-135. (On Reserve). He updated this in 2007 in "What is the history of books? Revisited" in *Modern Intellectual History*, 2007, vol. 4, pp. 495-508.

## **Additional Reading**

Elizabeth Eisenstein, *The Printing Revolution in Early Modern Europe* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983)

Sabrina Alcorn Baron et al eds. *Agent of Change: Print Culture Studies After Elizabeth Eisenstein* (University of Massachusetts Press, 2007), Intro.

Leslie Howsam, "Models of the Book's Place in History" in her *Old Books and New Histories: An Orientation to Studies in Book and Print Culture* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006).

Elizabeth Eisenstein, Printing Press as an Agent of Change.

3. September 24, 2012. Printing and the Reformation. What role did printing play in the Reformation? Who wrote pamphlets and books? Who printed them? Why? Who read them and why? How did Protestants use the press to advance their cause? How important were the new techniques to their success? How did Roman Catholics use the press and how successful were they? What links were there between the new technology and the levels of violence?

Luc Racaut, "Nicolas Chesneau, Catholic Printer in Paris during the French Wars of Religion", *The Historical Journal*, 52, 1 (2009), pp. 23-41. (Available on-line.)

Mark U. Edwards, *Printing, Propaganda and Martin Luther* (Berkeley, 1994), pp. 1-40; 149-173. (On Reserve)

Andrew Pettegree, *Reformation and the Culture of Persuasion* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005. Electronic book, pp. 128-184.

### **Additional Reading**

Luc Racaut, "Education of the Laity and Advocacy of Violence in Print during the French Wars of Religion" *History*, 2010. (Available on-line.)

Luc Racaut, *Hatred in print: Catholic propaganda and Protestant identity during the French wars of religion*, esp. pp. 7-22. On Reserve. BR 370 R33 2002

H.F.K. van Nierop, "Censorship, Illicit Printing and the Revolt of the Netherlands" in *Too Mighty to Be Free: Censorship and the Press in Britain and the Netherlands*, eds. A.C. Duke and C.A. Tamse (Zutphen, 1987), pp. 29-44. (On Reserve.)

Jean-François Gilmont, *Jean Calvin and the Printed Book* (Truman State University Press, 2005), chapter 6, "Censorship" pp. 245-276. (ILL)

4. October 1, 2012 The Roman Catholic Church and Censorship Assess the attitude of the Catholic Church to heresy? How did this affect their attitude to print? How and why did they attempt to supervise the printed word? What was the Index? Explore the relationships between church officials, government officials and printers and authors? How effective was control? How did it work? What does the story of Galileo's condemnation tell us?

Galileo's Condemnation and Recantation in *Versions of Censorship*, pp. 56-65.

Website on Galileo's trial:

http://www.law.umkc.edu/faculty/projects/ftrials/galileo/galileo.html

Christopher Black, *The Italian Inquisition* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2009) Chapter 7, "Censorship" pp. 158-207. On Reserve.

Paul Grendler, "The Roman Inquisition and the Venetian Press, 1540-1605" Journal of Modern History, 47, 1975., 48-65. (Also available in Paul Grendler, Culture and Censorship in Late Renaissance Italy and France (London 1981), chapters 9 and 13.)

# **Additional Reading**

Virgilio Pinto Crespo, "Thought Control in Spain" in *Inquisition and Society in Early Modern Europe* ed. Trans.Stephen Haliczer, (Totowa N.J.,1987), pp. 171-188. BX 1712 1576 1987

Clive Griffin, Journeymen-Printers, Heresy, and the Inquisition in Sixteenth-Century Spain (Oxford, 2005)

Carlo Ginzburg, The Cheese and the Worms

R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society* (Oxford, 1987) Gigliola Gragnito, *Church, Censorship and Culture in Early Modern Italy*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).

5. October 15, 2012 Seventeenth-Century England. What was the role of printing and of censorship in the English Revolution and Civil War in seventeenth-century England? What was the Licensing Act? Why did Milton write *Areopagitica*? What are the arguments he makes? What are the views he is trying to counter? From where did these views emerge? What are some case studies? Be sure to investigate these men: Overton, Bishop Laud William Prynne. What is physical bibliography and how do these techniques help up to understand censorship? Why do historians tend to believe that clandestine printing was imported from abroad and that subversion tended to be imported? Why did the Licensing Act lapse in the late seventeenth century? Did most men think differently about censorship at the end of the seventeenth century than they had at the beginning? Why or why not?

John Milton, *Areopagitica*, in, *Versions of Censorship*, pp. 9-34. Hobbes, "On the Liberty of Subjects" in *Versions of Censorship*, pp. 87-91.

David R. Como, "Secret Printing, the Crisis of 1640, and the Origins of Civil War Radicalism" *Past and Present*, no. 196 (August 2007) pp.37-82. (On-line)

Lois Schwoerer, "Liberty of the Press and Public Opinion, 1660-1695" in J.R. Jones ed. *Liberty secured? Britain before and after 1688* (Stanford, 1992), pp.199 -230. (On Reserve.)

Randy Robertson, *Censorship and Conflict in Seventeenth-Century England : the subtle art of Division*(University Park: Penn State University Press, 2009, chapter 1. (On Reserve)

Cyndia Susan Clegg, *Press Censorship in Caroline England* (Cambridge, 2010), chapter 1. (On Reserve)

## **Additional Reading**

Lamont, *Marginal Prynne*, 1600-1699 DA 378 P 7 L 3 (On Reserve.) Cyndia Susan Clegg, *Press Censorship in Jacobean England* (Cambridge 2001) Cyndia Susan Clegg, *Press Censorship in Elizabethan England* (Cambridge, 1997), pp. 3-76.

Sheila Lambert, "State control of the press in theory and practice: the role of the Stationers Company before 1640" in Myers and Harris eds. *Censorship and the Control of Print in England and France 1600-1910*, pp. 1-32.

Jason Peacey,"The Management of Civil War Newspapers: Auteurs, Entrepreneurs and Edit", *The Seventeenth Century*, 21 no.1, Spring 2006, pp. 99-127. (On-line).

Peter Hinds, "Roger L'Estrange, the Rye House Plot, and the regulation of Political Discourse in Late-Seventeenth-Century London," *The Library*, March 2002, Vol. 3 Issue 1, p3-31. (This covers the period, 1683-1700.) (On-line). David Cressy, "Book Burning in Tudor and Stuart England," *The Sixteenth-Century Journal*, Vol. 36. No 2 (Summer 2005) pp. 359-374. (On-line).

6. October 22, 2012 The Enlightenment Why did some eighteenth-century intellectuals advocate freedom of the press? What did they mean when they said this? What were arguments they used? What limits did they want? What was the context of their views? Compare the Netherlands, France, Germany and Spain? What influence did these writings have in their societies or on governments? Explore the importance of eighteenth-century ideas about religion and social hiearchy.

#### All Students to Read

- J.-J. Rousseau, "Letter to M. d'Alembert" in Versions of Censorship, pp. 303-317.
- Eckhart Hellmuth, "Enlightenment and Freedom of the Press: The Debate in the Berlin Mittwochsgesellschaft, 1783-1784" *History*, vol. 83, 1998, pp. 420-444. (On-line)
- Javier Fernández Sebastián, "Toleration and Freedom of Expression in the Hispanic World between the Enlightenment and Liberalism" *Past and Present*, no, 211 (May 2011), pp.159-197. (On-line)

- Joris Van Eijnatten, "Between practice and principle: Dutch ideas on censorship and press freedom, 1579-1795" *Redescriptions: yearbook of political thought and conceptual history* 8, 85-113, 2004, pp. 1-29.
- Thomas M. Luckett, "Book Seizures and the Politics of Repression in Paris, 1787-89" in *Into Print* ed. Charles Walton, pp. 113-127. On Reserve.
- Raymond Birn, *Royal Censorship of Books in 18<sup>th</sup>-Century France* (Stanford U. Press, 2012) Chapter 7 "How to Censor Rebellion" pp. 99-113. (On Reserve)

## **Additional Readings**

- Sophia Rosenfeld, "Writing the History of Censorship in the Age of Enlightenment" in *Postmodernism and the Enlightenment: New Perspectives in Eighteenth-Century French Intellectual History* ed. Daniel Gordon, (New York: Routledge, 2001), pp.117-145. (On Reserve.)
- Gregory S. Brown, "Reconsidering the Censorship of Writers in Eighteenth-Century France: Civility, State Power, and the Public Theater in the Enlightenment" *The Journal of Modern History*, vol. 75, number 2, June 2003, pp. 235-268. (On-line)
- C.Kelly, "Rousseau and the Case for (and against) Censorship," *Journal of Politics*, vol. 59, pp. 1232-1251 (On-line)
- Roger Chartier, *The Cultural Origins of the French Revolution*, (Durham and London, 1991), pp. 3-19;67-91;110-135.

Three students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

7. 29 Ocober, 2012: The French Revolution. In 1789 the French Revolutionaries issued the Declaration fo the Rights of Man and included freedom of the press. Why? What did they mean by this? Did most French men and women want freedom of the press? Why were many wary about it? How did they view press controls? How was freedom of the press implemented? What economic effect did it have on writers, printers and publishers? How did the government deal with opposition printing? Assess the impact of the Terror? How did Napoleon regard freedom of the press?

### All Students to Read

- Charles Walton, *Policing Public Opinion in the French Revolution: the Culture of Calumny and the Problem of Free Speech* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), pp. 73-93. (On Reserve)
- Essays by Bell, Hesse, Walton in *Into Print: Limits and Legacies of the Enlightenment*, ed.Charles Walton (On Reserve)
- Carla Hesse, "Economic Upheavals in Publishing" in *Revolution in Print*, Daniel Roche and Robert Darnton eds., pp. 69-97. (On Reserve)
- Richard Mowery Andrews, "Boundaries of Citizenship: The Penal Regulation of Speech in Revolutionary France" *French Politics and Society*, 7, no. 3, 1989, pp. 90-109. (On-line)
- Germaine de Stael, "Preface to De l'Allemagne" in *Versions of Censorship*, pp. 276-283.

# **Additional Reading**

- Charles Walton "La Liberté de la presse selon les cahiers de doléances de 1789, *Revue d'histoire moderne et contemporaine*, no. 53, 2006/1, pp. 63-87.
- Jeremy Popkin, "The royalist press in the reign of Terror" *Journal of Modern History*, 51, 1979, pp. 685-700.
- Carla Hesse, *Publishing and Cultural Politics in Revolutionary Paris*, 1789-1810 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991).
- Carla Hesse, "Enlightenment Epistemology and the Laws of Authorship in Revolutionary France, 1777-1793" in *Representations*, 1990, pp.109-137. (On-line)

Daniel Roche and Robert Darnton eds., *Revolution in Print*, Part II. Choose any articles.

Jean-Paul Bertaud, "An Open File: The Press under the Terror" in Keith Michael, *The French Revolution and the Creation of Modern Political Culture*, vol 4: *The Terror* (Oxford, Pergamon, 1994) pp.297-308.

Three students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

8. 5 November, 2012 Censorship 1815-1914 To what extent did liberal ideas in the nineteenth century affect censorship? Assess the arguments made in favour of press control and the arguments against. What were the limits? Compare ideas on censorship, approaches to and methods of censorship in England, France, Spain, the Austrian Empire, Russia? What role did printers and publishers play in advocating control? Who influenced governments on these issues?

#### All students to read

Alexis de Tocqueville, "Libertyof the Press in the United States" and "The Unlimited Power of the Majority" in *Versions of Censorship* pp. 139-149.

J.S. Mill, On Liberty, chapter 2: <a href="http://www.bartleby.com/130/2.html">http://www.bartleby.com/130/2.html</a>

Christine Haynes, "The Politics of Publishing under the Second Empire: The Trial of Madame Bovary Revisited, "French Politics, Culture and Society 23, no.2 (Summer 2005), 1-27. (On-line)

George Bernard Shaw, "The Necessity of Immoral Plays" in *Versions of Censorship*, pp. 333-344.

The introduction to Robert Justin Goldstein, *The War for the Public Mind:*Political Censorship in Nineteenth-Century Europe (Westport, Connecticut and London, 2000), pp. 1-34 and one of the chapters on Germany, Italy, France, Spain, The Austrian Empire, Russia. (On Reserve)

### **Additional Reading**

Christine Haynes, Lost Illusions: The Politics of Publishing in Nineteenth-Century France (Harvard, 2010). (On Reserve)

Robert Goldstein, Censorship of Political caricature in nineteenth-century France (Kent, 1989). (On Reserve)

Dominique La Capra, *Madame Bovary on Trial*. (On Reserve)

Three students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

9. 12 November, 2012 Censorship and World War I. Outline the views on press control during World War I comparing Austria, Germany, France and England. How did it work? How effective was it? Why was defeatism so feared? What else concerned officials? What role did publishers, government official and others play? What economic factors played a role?

#### All students to read

Maureen Healy, *Vienna and Fall of the Habsburg Empire: Total War and Everyday Life in World War I* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press), chapter 3 "Censorship, rumors and denunciation," 2004, pp.122-159 (On Reserve).

Deian Hopkin, "Domestic Censorship in the First World War," *Journal of Contemporary History*, Vol. 5, no. 4. (1970), pp. 151-169. (On-line)

Ross F. Collins, *The Development of Censorship in World War I France* (Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, 1992. (ILL)

Ross F. Collins, "The Business of Journalism in Provincial France during World War I, *Journalism History* 27: 3 (Fall, 2001) pp. 112-121.

John D. Halliday, "Censorship in Berlin and Vienna during the First World War: A Comparative View" *Modern Language Review*, July 1988, vol 83, issue 3 612-626. (On-line)

Four students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

## 10. 19 November, 2012 Censorship in World War II

Compare censorship in the First World War with that in the World War II. Who was in charge of it and why? Explore book burning in Nazi Germany and explain why it has become so central to American understanding of the Nazi era? What options did publishers in occupied territories have? Assess censorship and the voluntary code of regulations in the United States. Who were the censorship missionaries in the United States? Explore their role, ativities and thinking.

J.M. Ritchie, "The Nazi Book-burning" *Modern Language Review*, July 1988, vol. 83, issue 3, pp. 627-643. (On-line)

George L. Mosse and James W. Jones, "Bookburning and the Betrayal of German Intellectuals" *New German Critique*, No. 31, (Winter, 1984), pp.143-155. (Online)

Matthew Fishburn, "Books are Weapons: Wartime Responses to the Nazi bookfires of 1933," *Book History*, vol. 10, 2007, pp. 223-251. (On-line)

Michael Sweeney, "Censorship Missionaries of World War II, *Journalism History* 27:1 (Spring 2001) pp. 4-13. (On-line).

Sjoerd Van Faassen and Salma Chen, "A.A.M. Stols, Publisher: 'We are not collaborators'. *Quaerendo*, Autumn/Winter2010, Vol. 40 Issue 3/4, p327-354. (On-line)

Mark Bourrie, *The Fog of War: Censorship of Canada's Media in World War Two* (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre), 2011, chapter 1, pp. 9-51. D 799 C2 B69 2011 (On Reserve)

# **Additional Reading**

Jeffrey A. Smith, *War and Press Freedom: The Problem of Prerogative Power* (Princeton, 1999) (Electronic Version available.) Francis Williams, *Press, Parliament and People*, (London, 1946), pp. 3-84.(On-Reserve)

Michael Sweeney, *Secrets of Victory: the Office of Censorship and the American Press and radio in World War II* (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, c2001 esp. 7-39. (On Reserve)

R.A,H. Vos, : "The Dutch Press under the German Occupation. 1940-1945" in *Too Mighty to be Free: Censorship and the Press in Britain and the Netherlands*, eds. A.C.Duke and C.A. Tamse (Zutphen, 1987). (ILL)

Taylor, "Censorship in Britain and the Second World War: an Overview" in *Too Mighty to be Free: Censorship and the Press in Britain and the Netherlands*, eds. A.C.Duke and C.A. Tamse (Zutphen, 1987). (ILL)

Four students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

11. 26 November, 2012 Censorship in the Cold War Compare state- media relations in England and America in the post-war years? To what extent are these a continuation of relationships developed during World War II? What were the fears of government officials? What did the wider public think? Who was critical of government influence on the press? Why? How influential were the critics? What role did journalists' views on freedom of the press play? What other factors were important?

### All students to read

Tony Shaw, "The BBC, the State and Cold War Culture: The Case of Tevision's The War Game (1965) *English Historical Review*, Vol CXXI, 2006, No. 494 pp.1351-1384. (On-line)

Ray Bradbury, Fahrenheit 451.

Nancy E. Bernhard, "Clearer than Truth: Public Affairs Television and the State Department's Domestic Information Campaigns, 1947-1952" *Diplomatic History*, Vol. 21, No. 4 (Fall,1997), pp. 545-567. (On-line)

Chester J. Pach Jr., "And that's the Way it was: The Vietnam War on the Network Nightly News" in David Farber, ed., *The Sixties: From Memory to History* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1994. (On Reserve)

## Additional Readings on Censorship in the United States in 20c Century

- Paul S. Boyer, "Boston Book Censorship in the Twenties," *American Quarterly*, vol 15, no. 1 (Spring 1963), 3-24. (On-line)
- Paul S. Boyer, *Purity in Print: Book Censorship in America from the Gilded Age to the Computer Age*. Madison, Wis.: University of Wisconsin Press, 2002. (On Reserve)

Three students will make short presentations of the arguments in their essays in this class.

12. 29 November, 2012 Contemporary Issues Think about the themes that have emerged in this course and consider them when analysing contemporary censorship issues.

Karen L. Bird," Racist Speech or Free Speech?," *Comparative Politics*, 2000, pp. 399-418. (On-line).

- Edward S. Herman and Noam Chomsky, "A Propaganda Model" in *Manufacturing Consent: The political economy of the Mass Media*, pp. 1-35. (On Reserve.)
- Articles on current controversies: (Brand Police (and the Olympics), Google Books, Wikileaks, Post 9/11, Ann Coulter, Mistry, Hate Speech, University Social Media Policies, China, New Yorker Illustration of Obama, Mark Steyn and Macleans Magazine, Genestar dismissal, Danish Cartoons, Academic Freedom (Margaret Sommerville, Shiraz Dossa, Nancy Olivieri, Philipe Rushton etc.).

## **Additional Readings**

Nick Cohen, *You can't read this book* (London: Fourth Estate) 2012 Naomi Klein, *No Logo*, pp. 165-190.

Robert Fulford, "Into the Heart of the Matter" *Rotunda*, 1991, pp. 19-28.

Stanley Fish, There is No Such Thing as Free Speech

Sue Curry Jansen, Censorship: The Knot that Binds Power and Knowledge Robert Darnton, The Case for Books: Past, Present, Future, 2009.